

## The Effect Of Talking Stick Learning Model On Students' Understanding And Independence In Citizenship Subjects

Siska Pratiwi<sup>1</sup>, Firdatus Sholihah<sup>2</sup>, Rabeeyah<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>STKIP PGRI Bangkalan, Indonesia, [siskapradiwi@stkippgri-bkl.ac.id](mailto:siskapradiwi@stkippgri-bkl.ac.id) \*(Corresponden)

<sup>2</sup>STKIP PGRI Bangkalan, Indonesia, [firdatussholihah01@gmail.com](mailto:firdatussholihah01@gmail.com)

<sup>3</sup>Jamiah Islam Syeikh Daud Al-Fathoni, Yala, Thailand, [rabeeyahjisda@gmail.com](mailto:rabeeyahjisda@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

Background	Students often feel bored, unfocused, and experience difficulties in understanding the material explained by the teacher because the methods used are monotonous. Some students are noisy, joke around, move around the classroom, and frequently leave and enter during lesson hours. The teacher rarely employs alternative learning models to make the lessons engaging and appealing to the students. Consequently, students' understanding and independence are still not optimal.
Purpose	This study aims to examine the effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and independence in Civic Education for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya.
Research Methodology	This study on the effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and independence in Civic Education for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya is a quantitative study using a one-group pretest-posttest design.
Result	The average results of students' understanding and independence indicate that the implementation of the Talking Stick learning model can improve students' comprehension. The paired sample t-test analysis yielded a significance value of $0.000 < 0.05$ . There is a significant effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and independence in Grade II Civic Education at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya.
Conclusion	The Talking Stick learning model effectively improved students' understanding and independence in Civic Education at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. The analysis showed a significant positive effect of the learning model on second-grade students, indicating that this method can support better comprehension and independent learning skills.
Keywords	Learning Model, Talking Stick, Understanding, Independence



This Work Is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

## INTRODUCTION

Education is the key in every effort to improve the quality of an individual's life, serving both as a means and an object to humanize humans. Therefore, the focus of education is defined as the development of an excellent personality, emphasizing the maturation of logical reasoning, heart, morality, and faith. The pinnacle of education is the achievement or realization of the highest quality of life (Lazuardi, 2017). Teachers play a crucial role in the learning process. They act as facilitators to guide and educate students. A teacher is a professional educational worker who educates, teaches a subject, guides, trains, assesses, and evaluates students (Utami, 2022). Beyond merely guiding and teaching, teachers also shape students' character, fostering independence and responsibility.

In the field of education, learning models are indispensable. A learning model serves as a teacher's method of delivering instruction. Teachers can choose models according to their instructional goals. A learning model is a specially designed framework with systematic steps implemented during educational activities. Moreover, it is often referred to as a design crafted specifically for implementation (Mirdad & Pd, 2020). The learning model needed by students is one that makes them comfortable and ensures they understand the material explained by the teacher, enabling them to achieve the intended learning objectives.

Based on initial observations conducted from August 5–25, 2024, at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya, several problems were identified. Teachers predominantly used lecture methods, causing students to feel bored, unfocused, and struggling to understand the material during lessons. Due to the monotonous method, some students were noisy, joked around, moved around the classroom, and frequently left and entered during class. These problems affected students' independence when completing tasks, as many still asked teachers or peers for help and were unable to answer questions independently. Furthermore, teachers rarely employed alternative learning models to make lessons more engaging and appealing, resulting in suboptimal understanding and independence among students.

Understanding refers to an individual's ability to comprehend and master information so that it can be restated and explained clearly in their own words. This ability involves not only memorization but also interpreting, explaining, and organizing information more deeply. In line with this, Bloom (Kusmawati & Ginanjar S., 2016) states that understanding involves grasping meaning, breaking down material into simpler forms, interpreting, and classifying the provided information. In other words, understanding requires students not only to know but also to explain and connect the concepts learned. Therefore, understanding is a critical competence that enables students to complete tasks, actively participate in learning, and achieve the desired educational outcomes.

Independence is an attitude that individuals must develop to manage themselves in daily life and in the learning process. Observations show that some students still hesitate to take out their books unless instructed, need help finding materials, and seek assistance from teachers or peers to complete assignments. Learning independence is essential in the educational system to achieve learning objectives, emphasizing students' active role in developing their potential and talents. Independent learning allows students to self-manage various learning strategies needed to achieve the desired outcomes. Optimal learning achievement in schools can be realized through fostering student independence (Nasution et al., 2018).

Based on the background outlined above, the researcher sees the need to provide solutions to various issues in the learning process, particularly concerning students' understanding and independence. The current teaching strategies have not fully enabled students to actively engage, comprehend the material effectively, or develop learning independence. Therefore, the researcher deems it important to conduct a study that offers an alternative, more effective, and enjoyable learning model for elementary school students. One relevant model is the Talking Stick learning model, which can increase student engagement, foster confidence, and help them

understand material more interactively. Based on these considerations, this study is entitled: The Effect of the Talking Stick Learning Model on Students' Understanding and Independence in Civic Education for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya.

### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In this study, the researcher employed a quantitative research method. Quantitative research is a type of study that uses numerical data. The design applied in this research is the one-group pretest-posttest design, which involves a single group measured before and after treatment. This design is used to determine the level of students' understanding and independence obtained from the implementation of the Talking Stick learning model in Civic Education (PPKN) for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. The research was conducted at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya, located on Jalan Raya Tengket, Arosbaya District, Bangkalan Regency, East Java Province. The population refers to the entire objects or subjects of the study with specific criteria and characteristics determined by the researcher and becomes the target for research conclusions (Sulistiyowati, 2017). The population in this study consisted of Grade 2A students, totaling 22 students. A sample is a portion of the population that will serve as the actual data in a study. The sampling method used was saturated sampling, where all members of the population are included as the sample. Therefore, the sample consisted of the 22 students of Grade 2A at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya.

The research instruments consisted of test instruments in the form of questions and non-test instruments in the form of questionnaires. Data from the test instruments were students' comprehension scores obtained from multiple-choice questions in the PPKN subject. Meanwhile, data from the non-test instruments were collected through questionnaires measuring students' independence, distributed to all Grade 2 students at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. The comprehension test served as a benchmark to evaluate students' understanding during learning activities. The test consisted of 10 multiple-choice questions, each worth 10 points. Students answering correctly would receive 10 points per question, while incorrect answers received 0 points. The student independence questionnaire was used to determine the level of independence during learning activities. A questionnaire is a non-test instrument given to students based on actual classroom conditions. The data collection technique used in this study was a questionnaire, which involves providing written questions or statements for respondents to answer. The questionnaire in this study was aimed at assessing student independence.

The data analysis techniques employed included validity and reliability testing, normality testing, and paired sample t-test analysis. The effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and independence was evaluated based on the results of the test and questionnaire. These instruments were also used to determine the validity and reliability of the

data. Validity testing is a procedure conducted to evaluate the content of an instrument, aiming to determine the accuracy of the instrument used in research (Arsi, 2021). An instrument is considered valid if it accurately measures what it is intended to measure. The researcher used SPSS 2.1 for Windows to determine validity. Reliability testing ensures that the instruments used in the study provide consistent and trustworthy information and can effectively describe conditions in the field (Arsi, 2021). The reliability of the data was also measured using SPSS 2.1 for Windows. Normality testing aims to determine whether the data distribution is normal. This was carried out by examining the histogram of residuals and the normal probability plot. The analysis was conducted using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test in SPSS 2.1 for Windows. The paired sample t-test was used to examine the effectiveness of the treatment by identifying differences between the mean scores before and after the implementation of the learning model.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This study was conducted on Grade II A students at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya, with a total of 22 respondents, comprising 11 male and 11 female students. The research data were analyzed using several statistical tests, including validity testing, reliability testing, normality testing, and paired sample t-test, with the assistance of IBM SPSS for Windows version 21.0. These steps were carried out to examine the collected data and to answer the research questions or test the hypotheses. The study aimed to determine the effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and independence in Civic Education (PPKN) for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. In this study, validity testing was conducted to measure whether the research instruments were valid. The IBM SPSS for Windows v21.0 application was used for this purpose. The decision criterion was: if  $r_{\text{calculated}} > r_{\text{table}}$ , the instrument is considered valid; conversely, if  $r_{\text{calculated}} < r_{\text{table}}$ , the instrument is considered invalid. Based on this criterion, the student comprehension test consisted of 10 items that were valid.

From the trial results of the comprehension test, out of 20 students tested, 10 items were declared valid, while 10 items were invalid, with  $r_{\text{table}} = 0.444$ , analyzed using IBM SPSS v21.0 for Windows. Reliability testing was used to determine the consistency level of the instruments. The decision criterion was: if  $r_{\text{Alpha}} > r_{\text{table}}$ , the instrument is reliable; if  $r_{\text{Alpha}} < r_{\text{table}}$ , it is not reliable. The reliability test of the comprehension test items showed  $r_{\text{Alpha}} = 0.722$ , which is greater than  $r_{\text{table}} (0.444)$ , indicating that the comprehension test items achieved a reliable level.

Table 1. Reliability Test Results

Reliability Statistics	
Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
,857	10

Similarly, the reliability test for the student independence questionnaire showed  $r_{\text{Alpha}} = 0.857$ , which is greater than  $r_{\text{table}} (0.444)$ , indicating that the independence questionnaire also reached a reliable level.

Normality testing was conducted to determine whether the pretest and posttest data were normally distributed. The decision criterion was: if  $\text{sig.} < 0.05$ , the data distribution is considered not normal; if  $\text{sig.} > 0.05$ , the data distribution is considered normal. The normality test results for the student comprehension test showed a normal distribution, with a Kolmogorov-Smirnov  $Z = 0.668 > 0.05$ . Similarly, the normality test for the student independence questionnaire showed a normal distribution, with Kolmogorov-Smirnov  $Z = 0.274 > 0.05$ .

The Paired Sample T-Test was conducted to determine the difference in mean scores before and after the treatment. The decision criterion was: if the significance value  $> 0.05$ , then  $H_0$  is accepted or  $H_a$  is rejected (no significant difference in performance). Conversely, if the significance value  $< 0.05$ , then  $H_0$  is rejected or  $H_a$  is accepted (there is a significant difference in performance). The results of the paired sample t-test indicate that the student comprehension test scores showed a significant difference. This is evident from the pretest mean score of 76.36 and the posttest mean score of 85.45, with a significance value of  $0.000 < 0.05$ . Therefore, it can be concluded that the Talking Stick learning model has a positive effect on students' comprehension.

Table 2. Paired Sample T-Test Results

		Paired Samples Statistics			
		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	PRE TEST	32,9091	22	3,74050	,79748
	POST TEST	35,5000	22	3,32021	,70787

Similarly, the paired sample t-test results for the student independence questionnaire showed a significant difference. The pretest mean score was 32.90 and the posttest mean score was 35.50, with a significance value of  $0.000 < 0.05$ . Thus, it can be concluded that the Talking Stick learning model also has a positive effect on students' independence. After conducting the hypothesis testing, the next step is to discuss the findings in relation to the relevant theoretical framework. The analyses conducted by the researcher aimed to address all the research questions, and this study included four research hypotheses. There is an effect on students' comprehension using the Talking Stick learning model in Grade II Civic Education (PPKN) at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. Based on the analysis, the paired sample t-test result was 0.000, which is less than 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference in students' comprehension between the pretest and posttest scores. There is an effect on students' independence using the Talking Stick learning model in Grade II Civic Education (PPKN) at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya. Based on the analysis, the paired sample t-test result was 0.000, which is less than 0.05. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference in students' independence between the pretest and posttest scores.

The Talking Stick learning model has been proven to have a positive effect on students' critical thinking skills and engagement across various educational levels. At the secondary school level, a quasi-experimental study demonstrated a significant improvement in the critical thinking abilities of Grade X students, with the experimental group showing higher gains than the control group and an effect size of 0.3, categorized as moderate (Ifrianti et al., 2020). Similar results were

found among elementary school students, where the average pretest score increased from 44.86 to 88.83 in the posttest, with a normalized gain score of 0.79, classified as high, indicating a substantial improvement in critical thinking skills (Panjaitan et al., 2025). In general, the Talking Stick model encourages structured interaction, turn-taking in speaking, and active participation, which support the development of 21st-century competencies. Moreover, other studies have shown that using this model in Indonesian history lessons improved discipline, self-confidence, and learning interest among students, increasing from 58.1% to 86.1%, 65.2% to 86.9%, and 61.2% to 84.3%, respectively (Novianto et al., 2019).

Various learning models have also been shown to positively influence students' comprehension and learning independence. Blended learning, which integrates online and face-to-face learning, has proven more effective than conventional methods in enhancing critical thinking, comprehension, and learning autonomy. Research indicates that students using this model achieve higher post-test scores, reflecting improvements in both understanding and independent learning (Marito & Riani, 2023). Similarly, the flipped classroom model, which shifts content review to home and interactive activities to class, shows significant gains in comprehension and learning outcomes. Nursing students reported increased learning interest, better academic results, and stronger research skills (Wang et al., 2024). This model is also suitable for post-pandemic primary education, enhancing both understanding and independent learning skills (Nuryadin et al., 2023). Meanwhile, cooperative learning models, emphasizing group work and collaboration, have proven effective in improving comprehension and soft skills, evidenced by higher quiz and exam scores (Syukri & Nugroho, 2017, 2018).

Students' learning independence is influenced by models that promote thinking skills and self-management. Problem-Based Learning (PBL), particularly when aided by simulation applications like PhET, significantly enhances learning independence as students are required to actively seek solutions and manage their learning process (Saputra et al., 2020). The IMPROVE model also positively impacts problem-solving skills in mathematics and learning autonomy, where students with higher independence perform better in completing tasks (Yasin et al., 2020). Additionally, the reciprocal teaching model, which emphasizes peer teaching and learning, has proven more effective than conventional methods in improving social studies concept comprehension, especially among students with high interpersonal intelligence (Abas et al., 2019). These

findings indicate that learning models that emphasize active participation, collaboration, and self-management significantly contribute to enhancing students' comprehension and learning independence.

Model pembelajaran Talking Stick terbukti efektif dalam meningkatkan pemahaman, keaktifan, dan kemandirian siswa pada berbagai mata pelajaran, terutama Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan (PKn) dan mata pelajaran berbasis karakter. Penelitian menunjukkan bahwa model ini mampu meningkatkan partisipasi aktif siswa karena mereka harus siap menjawab saat tongkat diberikan secara acak, sehingga mendorong tanggung jawab dan keberanian (Ali et al., 2024). Selain itu, penerapan Talking Stick juga terbukti meningkatkan aktivitas belajar dan hasil belajar siswa kelas VIII melalui suasana pembelajaran yang lebih interaktif (Lande, 2021; Samba & Hariyanto, 2022). Dalam konteks penguatan karakter, metode ini berperan dalam membentuk sikap mandiri, percaya diri, dan kritis siswa (Azzahra & Simatupang, 2021; Asri et al., 2019). Pada tingkat lain, penerapan di pendidikan ekonomi dan agama juga menunjukkan peningkatan kemandirian belajar serta motivasi siswa (Umami & Cahyono, 2025; Maulana & Maghfiroh, 2025). Bahkan, pada pendidikan Pancasila, model ini membantu meningkatkan hasil belajar secara signifikan (Gofur et al., 2025).

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study and hypothesis testing through data analysis on the effect of the Talking Stick learning model on students' understanding and learning independence in Civics for Grade II at SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya, it was found that this model had a significant impact. The analysis using a paired sample t-test showed a 2-tailed significance value of 0.000, which is below the 0.05 threshold. Thus, the alternative hypothesis was accepted, and the null hypothesis was rejected. These results indicate a significant difference between the conditions before and after the implementation of the Talking Stick model, both in terms of PPKN concept comprehension and students' learning independence. The positive effect suggests that the Talking Stick model fosters a more active, interactive, and engaging learning environment. By using the stick as a tool for taking turns to speak, students are encouraged to focus, express their opinions confidently, and take responsibility for understanding the material. Moreover, this model promotes learning independence, as students have opportunities to prepare answers, comprehend the material individually, and collaborate within groups during learning activities. Overall, the study confirms that the Talking Stick learning model is an effective instructional strategy for lower elementary classes, particularly in Civics. It not only enhances students' conceptual understanding but also supports the development of independent learning behaviors essential for their educational growth.

This study contributes to the development of innovative learning strategies in Civic Education by proving that the Talking Stick learning model can improve students' understanding and independence in the learning process. The findings indicate that active and interactive learning methods are more effective in increasing students' participation and comprehension compared to conventional teaching approaches. However, this study has several limitations, including the small sample size and the use of a one-group pretest-posttest design without a control group, which may affect the generalizability of the results. Future research is recommended to involve larger samples, different educational levels, and comparative experimental designs to obtain more comprehensive findings. Overall, the study demonstrates that the Talking Stick learning model has a significant positive effect on students' learning outcomes and independent attitudes in Civics subjects, especially for second-grade elementary school students.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The researcher would like to express sincere gratitude to all parties who contributed to the completion of this study. Special appreciation is addressed to the principal, teachers, and students of SDN Tengket 2 Arosbaya

for their cooperation, participation, and support during the research process. The researcher also extends gratitude to STKIP PGRI Bangkalan for academic guidance and encouragement in conducting this study. This research is expected to contribute to the development of innovative and interactive learning models, particularly in Civic Education, by providing evidence that the Talking Stick learning model can enhance students' understanding and learning independence. Furthermore, the findings of this study are expected to have a positive impact on teachers' teaching strategies, encourage active classroom participation, and improve the quality of learning outcomes for elementary school students in Civics subjects.

### AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTION

- Author 1 : Conceptualization of the study, designing the research methodology, conducting data collection, analyzing the data, and drafting the manuscript.
- Author 2 : Assisting in the research design, validating research instruments, supervising data analysis, and reviewing the manuscript critically for important intellectual content.
- Author 3 : Supporting data interpretation, managing references and editing the manuscript, as well as providing final approval of the article before publication.

### REFERENCE

- Abas, M., Solihatin, E., & Nadiroh, N. (2019). Understanding the concept of social studies: A study of the effect of instruction models and interpersonal intelligence. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 5(3), 227–251.
- Ali, D., Matters, L. N., & Naidoo, Z. E. (2024). Talking Stick Model to Increase Student Learning Activity. *Journal of Education and Computer Applications*, 1(2), 9–14. <https://doi.org/10.69693/jeca.v1i2.15>
- Arsi, A. (2021). *Langkah-langkah uji validitas dan reliabilitas instrumen dengan menggunakan SPSS*. Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam (STAI) Darul Dakwah Wal-Irsyad, 1–8.
- Asri, B. W., Nurhalim, K., & Suhandini, P. (2019). The implementation of talking stick model assisted by audio-visual media toward positive character and learning outcome. *Journal of primary education*, 8(2), 225–231.
- Azzahra, S. F., & Simatupang, N. I. (2021). Implementation of Talking Stick Method on Acid-Base Concepts to Improve Students' Critical Thinking Skills. *International Journal of STEM Education for Sustainability*, 1(1), 53–59. <https://doi.org/10.53889/ijses.v1i1.8>
- Firda, & Lande, A. (2021). Improving student's learning activity in citizens learning using the talking stick type of learning model in Class VIII E SMP Vontry 1 Balaesang Donggala Regency. *Edu Civic*, 9(2), 42–50. <https://jurnalfkipuntad.com/index.php/educ/article/view/1748>
- Ifrianti, S., Shawmi, A. N., Asiah, N., Asyhari, A., Putri, L., & Komikesari, H. (2020). The effect size test of Talking Stick learning model on students' critical thinking skills. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1467(1), 012061. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1467/1/012061>
- Gofur, A., Windasari, W., & Ariansyah, C. (2025). The application of talking stick method can improve student learning outcomes in Pancasila Education class IV subjects at SDIT Al Furqon. *Jurnal Citizenship: Media Publikasi Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan*, 8(2), 37–45. <https://doi.org/10.12928/citizenship.v8i2.1373>

- Kusmawati, L., & Ginanjar, G. (2016). Peningkatan kemampuan pemahaman konsep perkalian melalui pendekatan pembelajaran konstruktivisme pembelajaran matematika di kelas 3 SDN Cibaduyut 4. *Didaktik: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD STKIP Subang*, 1(2), 262–271.
- Lazuardi, D. (2017). Manajemen kurikulum sebagai pengembangan tujuan pendidikan. *Jurnal Pendidikan*, 1, 99–112.
- Marito, W., & Riani, N. (2023). The effectiveness of blended learning model in improving critical thinking ability and student learning independence. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 2805(1), 090004. <https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0148541>
- Maulana, M. F., & Maghfiroh, M. (2025). The use of talking stick learning method in improving learning outcomes of the course of Aqidah and Morals in grade 5 at Sampang State Islamic Elementary School. *AL-WIJDĀN Journal of Islamic Education Studies*, 10(2), 424–448. <https://doi.org/10.58788/alwijdn.v10i2.6864>
- Mirdad, J. (2020). Model-model pembelajaran (empat rumpun model pembelajaran). *Jurnal Pendidikan*, 2(1), 14–23.
- Nasution, N., Rahayu, R. F., Yazid, S. T. M., & Amalia, D. (2018). Pengaruh kemandirian belajar terhadap hasil belajar siswa. *Jurnal Pendidikan Luar Sekolah*, 12(1), 9.
- Novianto, V., Febriani, E. D., & Utami, N. W. (2019). The increase of students' discipline, self-confidence, and interest in Indonesian history learning through the Talking Stick model. *International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research*, 8(12), 1814–1816.
- Nuryadin, A., Karlimah, K., Lidinillah, D. A. M., & Apriani, I. F. (2023). Blended learning after the pandemic: The flipped classroom as an alternative learning model for elementary classrooms. *Participatory Educational Research*, 10(3), 209–225. <https://doi.org/10.17275/per.23.52.10.3>
- Panjaitan, M. B., Siagian, A. F., Purba, N., Herman, H., Sutikno, S., Sinaga, Y. K., & Sihombing, S. D. (2025). Fostering the use of Talking Stick learning model on the critical thinking ability in science learning. *Journal of Curriculum and Teaching*, 14(4), 14–25. <https://doi.org/10.5430/jct.v14n4p14>
- Samba, N. Y. W., Hariyanto, H., Kurniawansyah, E., & Ismail, M. (2022). Improving learning outcomes of Class VIII-E students in Civics subjects through the talking stick type cooperative learning model at SMP Negeri 13 Mataram. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*, 5(2), 12059–12066. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i2.5043>
- Saputra, S., Jumadi, & Wilujeng, I. (2020). Physics-based learning effectiveness PhET simulation model using Problem Based Learning (PBL) for self-independent learning on material and energy. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1567(3), 032097. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1567/3/032097>
- Sulistiyowati, W. (2017). Buku ajar statistika dasar. *Statistika Dasar*, 14(1), 15–31.
- Syukri, Y., & Nugroho, B. H. (2017). Implementation of cooperative learning through collaboration with foreign lecturer to improve students' understanding and soft skills. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 1823, 020119. <https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4978192>
- Syukri, Y., & Nugroho, B. H. (2018). Implementation of cooperative learning through collaboration with foreign lecturer. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 2026, 020051. <https://doi.org/10.1063/1.5065011>
- Umami, L., Cahyono, A. E., & Wijaya, S. A. (2025). Implementation of talking stick model in economics to foster independence of grade XI students at MA Miftahul Ulum Suren. *Jurnal Pendidikan Ekonomi (JURKAMI)*, 10(3), 852–860. <https://doi.org/10.31932/jpe.v10i3.5323>

## Journal of Comprehensive Education

- Utami, Y. P. (2022). Kajian pustaka: Analisis penanaman karakter disiplin peserta didik pada masa pembelajaran tatap muka terbatas. *Skripsi, Universitas Muhammadiyah Purwokerto*, 1–33.
- Wang, Y., Wang, G.-J., Yan, L.-J., Gao, J., Fu, C., & Ren, H.-M. (2024). Qualitative research on the flipped classroom cognition of undergraduate nursing students. *BMC Medical Education*, 24(1), 1460. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-06426-7>
- Yasin, M., Huda, S., Putra, F. G., Syazali, M., Umam, R., & Widyawati, S. (2020). IMPROVE learning model and learning independence. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1467(1), 012003. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1467/1/012003>